

**Minutes
Plan Commission Meeting
January 9, 2017
7:00pm**

Chair Busse called the meeting of the City of Monona Plan Commission to order at 7:00 pm.

Present: Chair Alder Jim Busse, Mr. Griff Dorschel, Mr. Robert Stein, Mr. Chris Homburg, Ms. Kathy Thomas, Alder Brian Holmquist, Ms. Susan Fox and Mr. Dale Ganser
Also present: City Planner & Economic Development Director Sonja Reichertz

Approval of Minutes

A motion by Ms. Thomas, seconded by Ms. Fox, to approve the minutes of October 24, 2016 carried with corrections.

A motion by Ms. Thomas, seconded by Mr. Ganser, to approve the minutes of December 12, 2016 Plan Commission minutes carried with corrections.

A motion by Ms. Thomas, seconded by Ms. Fox, to approve the minutes of the joint Plan Commission and CDA meeting on December 12, 2016 carried with corrections.

Appearances - There were no appearances.

Unfinished Business

A. Consideration of Action on Request for Approval of a Landscape Ground Sign Permit for the Property at 950 E Broadway, the Broadway Car Wash.

A motion was made by Mr. Dorschel and seconded by Mr. Stein to remove this item from table. The motion carried.

Kristen Eastman, of Grant Signs, explained revisions including a tan sign base and blue tenant panel color to better match the building. The text style and orientation was also revised. Planner Reichertz said the application was tabled at the previous meeting due to concerns with the sign's compatibility with adjacent signs and building characteristics. The Sign Code requires a minimum 15 feet setback from the curb but not on the right-of-way. Staff measured the setback in GIS and recommended to include a condition that the sign be at least 25 feet from the curb and on private property.

Alder Holmquist asked Reichertz about the ROW width. Staff explained that the online GIS measures approximately 10 feet between the curb and the property line. Mr. Homburg proposed that the third condition of approval should have a minimum setback of 15 feet and must be located on private property rather than specifying 25 feet. Planner Reichertz stated that if the applicant can show that the sign is on private property, that condition is fine.

A motion was made by Ms. Thomas and seconded by Mr. Ganser to approve the sign permit request for a Landscape Ground Sign for Broadway Car Wash at 950 E Broadway, according to Section 13-1-220 of the Monona Municipal Code of Ordinances with the following conditions of approval:

1. Landscaping shall be planted at the time of the sign's installation and maintained as shown on the approved landscaping plan.

2. No other off-building signage is permitted for this site.
3. The sign shall be installed on private property and a site plan verifying the location shall be submitted to staff for approval prior to installation.

The motion carried.

B. Public Hearing on Request a Zoning Permit for Exterior Alterations to the Taco Bell at 100 E Broadway.

Aaron Engler, Border Foods of Wisconsin, LLC, stated that they received comments at the October meeting and accommodated feedback into their revised plans.

C. Consideration of Action on Request for a Zoning Permit for Exterior Alterations to the Taco Bell at 100 E Broadway.

Reichertz said that staff is recommending approval as outlined in the staff report. She also shared a photo of another restaurant location's LED slat wall to show how the LED lighting looks at night.

A motion of approval was made by Mr. Homburg and seconded by Mr. Ganser to approve the zoning permit for exterior alterations for the Taco Bell at 100 E. Broadway, with the following findings of fact and conditions of approval:

Findings of Fact:

1. The Plan Commission determined that the proposed architectural alterations, including color and roof form, are consistent with the E Broadway Design Guidelines.

Conditions of Approval:

1. All required state and local building permits shall be obtained.
2. The existing building EIFS color shall remain the cream color, not camelback.

Mr. Homburg said the photo of the other Taco Bell at night was a bit shocking, but since the proposed Monona wall is smaller he is not concerned. Mr. Ganser said he appreciates keeping the cream color.

The motion carried.

D. Public Hearing on Request for a Zoning Permit, Site Plans, and Building Elevations for Redevelopment of the Sites at 105 E Broadway and 6400 Monona Drive for a new PDQ Convenience Store, Two-Bay Car Wash and Gas Canopy with 10 Fueling Dispensers.

Mr. Chris Homburg abstained from this item.

Andrew Homburg, property owner of 6400 Monona Drive, presented on behalf of Dan Bertler (Supreme Structures). Also present were Jeremy Smith (PDQ) and architect Peter Pichotta (Angus Young). The proposed site plan includes a 6,400 SF convenience store, a two-bay carwash and a gas canopy with 10 fueling dispensers. He emphasized that the convenience store model is changing and will offer more food selection including natural food, bakery, and fresh deli.

Ms. Thomas asked if there are deed restrictions on the site. Mr. Andrew Homburg said his property has deed restrictions which severely limit the commercial options. The deed restrictions preclude any alcohol, tobacco, coffee or energy (fuel) sales. He has tried to recruit national retailers and mixed-use tenants for the site, but it has been very challenging given the site constraints. He explained that another difficult element of the site is the expense of demolition and removal of the common wall with Crawford's Landing. They also explored adaptive reuse which is not financially feasible. Additionally, development of this site for a higher density use with underground parking would require TIF and there are currently no TIF funds available for this site. Mr. Homburg explained that the proposed construction cost of the project is \$5 million and which will add \$2.5 million in assessed value to the City of Monona.

Jeremy Smith listed some improvements including improved access and circulation, more parking, improved c-store offerings, as well as a bright and open building architecture. Architect Peter Pichotta explained plan revisions including a revised sidewalk from E Broadway, shepherd's hook light fixtures and more decorative wood gates for the dumpster enclosure.

Andrew Homburg stated that Dan Bertler (Supreme Structures) met with Crawford's Landing residents and some concerns were raised including drainage issues, request for extension of a fence to prevent on their property, and fixing a retaining wall.

Tim Helman of Farmers Insurance, tenant at 6238 Monona Drive spoke in favor of the project. He thinks this project will improve the site.

Phil DeVillers, 3939 Monona Drive, spoke in favor of the development which he things will be a great improvement to the community and tax base.

Erinn Monroe-Nye, 209 Femrite Drive, spoke against the development with potential for her to be in favor if modifications are made. She moved to Monona three years ago and would like the community to be more walkable and to support new urbanist values like higher density developments. She said that Monona is generally attractive to young families but also deters people because it is auto-centric. She asked if the development could incorporate design features that would move the building closer to Monona Drive and possibly place the pumps behind the building so people can enter it from the street. She would like to see something more forward thinking and progressive to be more inviting to pedestrian traffic.

Doug Smith, 213 Femrite, spoke against the development. He expressed concern with the possibility of cars exiting onto Roselawn because there are many families and children that use that street with no sidewalks. He would like the City to support projects that are more attractive to people moving into the community and that another car wash is not one of those features.

Darrin Pope, Vierbicher Associates, made an appearance and explained that he reviewed the site plans for stormwater management and conformance to the ordinances. Mr. Pope said that in the southeast corner of the site, the sidewalk from East Broadway needs modifications to be more compliant with ADA rules including a truncated down and reconfiguration of the path. Spot elevations need to be added near the Roselawn pedestrian crossing. Sites are required to have 30% greenspace; proposed is less than 30% but is much improved over existing. The redevelopment increases the amount of stormwater draining to Monona Drive, so the utility capacity needs to be confirmed. He said that vehicle circulation will be improved.

E. Consideration of Action on Request for a Zoning Permit, Site Plans, and Building Elevations for Redevelopment of the Sites at 105 E Broadway and 6400 Monona Drive for a new PDQ Convenience Store, Two-Bay Car Wash and Gas Canopy with 10 Fueling Dispensers.

Mr. Chris Homburg abstained from this item.

Planner Reichertz recommended approval with findings of fact and conditions as listed in the staff report. She also handed out before and after assessed value comparison for recent Monona redevelopment projects.

Mr. Dorschel spoke regarding whether this is the highest and best use for the site. He is persuaded that it is at this time because of the barriers to redevelopment 6400 Monona Drive and that it is an expansion of an already existing use. He does not think it will generate more traffic onto Roselawn.

Ms. Fox agreed with Mr. Dorschel about Roselawn traffic. Limiting the car wash hours from 7am-11pm may be better than leaving it open ended as written in the staff report because then the City is relying on complaints which is more difficult for residents. She understands the development difficulties with the property and believes this project will greatly enhance the site.

Mr. Ganser said the responsibility of the Commission is to encourage the highest and best use of properties which includes adding community services and the highest assessed value. He stated that assessed value is very important because single family residents in Monona are bearing an inappropriate burden because of the undervalued commercial properties on Monona Drive and Broadway. He reviewed 22 PDQs in the Madison area and only 2 of them had 10 gas pumps. Only 2 PDQs exceeded \$2 million in assessed value. The current value of this property is \$1.4 million and he doubts the tax value will really have a substantial increase if any. He stated that this project is not really bringing any new services to Monona and that PDQ should pursue a more mixed-use new urbanist style development on this site, with PDQ as an anchor. He suggested 6 gas pumps instead of 10 and bringing in some multi-family units above the convenience store.

Alder Holmquist said he likes the inclusion of pitched roofs. He stated his concern over the pedestrian path off of Broadway because it is angled through paved area which may be difficult for someone with a vision impairment to navigate. Chris Homburg said that the sidewalk location was limited by a transformer and air compressor. Alder Holmquist responded to a public hearing comment regarding the building setback. He felt it is more consistent with adjacent properties to be further setback. There are places where that is a better design fit, such as with Fairway Glen.

Mr. Stein said he is torn on the project because it does add many positive things to the property, like the additional green space and blight elimination. He is concerned with the 6 more gas pumps and thinks removing some would improve pedestrian circulation and make it more appropriate for the community. He pointed out the gas canopy area is larger than the c-store. Mr. Stein stated that he tends to agree with Mr. Ganser as far as best use goes. He believes traffic onto Roselawn will increase because of the car wash exit and is in support of limiting the car wash hours. He would also want assurance that the common wall issue would be handled by either party.

Mr. Ganser asked where they came up with the need for 10 gas pumps. Mr. Smith said that it is a safety issue resulting from vehicle circulation. He also said customers spend more time at the pump while parked and then going inside.

Ms. Thomas spoke regarding the highest and best use issue. She requested feedback from the CDA Chair who said it is a good location for this use and reasonable expansion of an existing use. She also thinks limitations for the car wash hours of operation are appropriate.

Chair Busse asked Mr. Andrew Homburg to explain further why he thought mixed-use would not be viable here. Mr. Homburg stated that he has worked with numerous developers on this project, and the deed restrictions are the most limiting. He said that PDQ has had mixed-tenancy in other locations, and it did not work well for them. Mr. Homburg also explained that this project is not receiving any TIF funds, compared to other mixed-use projects that had public investment.

Mr. Stein said that the number of gas pumps is a big issue. Mr. Dorschel said that he agrees and 8 pumps is a reasonable compromise. With the reduction to 8 pumps which creates more room on the east side of the site to reconfigure the pedestrian path. Discussion included routing the sidewalk between the transformer on the east, and moving the air compressor and curb to the west side of the sidewalk, routing it straight north, with a direct, straight connection west to the coverage area provided by the gas canopy, and into the store.

A motion was made by Ms. Thomas and seconded by Ms. Fox to approve a zoning permit, building elevations, and site plans for tear-down of the existing structures at 105 E Broadway and 6400 Monona Drive, and reconstruction of a new 6,000 SF PDQ convenience store, two-bay car wash, and 8 pump gas canopy, as proposed, according to Section 13-1-180 with the following findings of fact and conditions of approval:

Findings of Fact:

1. The building architecture and design substantially comply with applicable sections of the Monona Drive Urban Design Guidelines and E Broadway Urban Design Guidelines.
2. The E Broadway Design Guidelines and Appendix A of the Zoning Code include guidelines that the site should be covered in 30% open green space. The site plan shows a proposed 23% green space. This is acceptable due to the substantial increase over the existing site green space of 5%.

Conditions of Approval:

1. All required state and local building permits shall be obtained.
2. A monitored alarm system and Knox Box are required and plans shall be submitted to the City's Fire Chief prior to granting of occupancy permits.
3. Demolition of the existing building at 6400 Monona Drive may result in an exposed unfinished wall on the building at 115 E Broadway, as the two buildings currently share a common wall. Detailed plans to address this newly exposed wall, resulting in a finished architecture on the building at 115 E Broadway, shall be submitted for Plan Commission review and approval prior to granting of occupancy permits for the PDQ redevelopment.
4. Revised plans, revised stormwater management plan report, and a letter that addresses each comment found in the 1/5/17 letter from Vierbicher Associates shall be submitted for approval by the City's consulting engineer prior to approval of stormwater and erosion control permits.

5. Verification of adequate available capacity in the City's storm sewers in Monona Drive downstream of the site for the proposed additional runoff from the site shall be submitted for approval by the City's consulting engineer prior to approval of stormwater and erosion control permits.
6. A City of Monona standard stormwater facilities maintenance agreement ("Declaration of Conditions, Covenants and Restrictions for Maintenance of Stormwater Management Measures") modified specifically for this site including maintenance provisions for catch basin sumps, inlet filters, storm sewers, grass swales, and bio-retention area shall be submitted for approval by the City's consulting engineer prior to approval of stormwater and erosion control permits.
7. Erosion control and stormwater management permit applications shall be submitted to the City's consulting engineer for review and approval.
8. City of Monona requires service laterals to be abandoned at the main which would require opening Monona Drive. This shall be confirmed with the Public Works Director. If Monona Drive is opened then street patching requirements shall apply.
9. Noise emissions from the car wash shall comply with Ordinance No. 13-1-42 of the Zoning Code regarding allowable noise levels. The car wash shall not be operated between 12:00 midnight and 7:00am. If complaints are received by city staff regarding car wash noise, the Plan Commission reserves the right to limit the operating hours of the car wash or impose additional conditions.
10. The proposed chain link with slats dumpster enclosure gate shall be replaced with a gate made of more decorative material and plans showing this change shall be submitted to the City Planner for review and approval.
11. The proposed bronze finish light fixtures shall be replaced with black finish light fixtures and plans showing this change shall be submitted to the City Planner for review and approval.
12. Landscaping shall be maintained as shown on the approved landscaping plan. Specifically, if plantings are damaged near the car wash due to vehicle salt or other damage, they shall be replaced as shown on the approved landscaping plan.
13. The pedestrian walkway from Broadway to the convenience store building shall be modified as described in the 1/5/17 review letter from Vierbicher Associates, and as discussed at the Plan Commission meeting on 1/9/17 with final plans submitted to staff for approval.
14. An easement between the two properties allowing for access to the 6328 Monona Drive property from the 6400 Monona Drive Property shall be submitted for staff approval.
15. A lot line adjustment showing consolidation of the property at 105 E Broadway and 6400 Monona Drive into one parcel shall be submitted to staff for review, and to the Dane County Register of Deeds. City review of a Certified Survey Map is not required because new parcels will not be created.
16. Future signage plans shall be submitted for Plan Commission review.

17. The location for a new City of Monona monument sign and street identification feature shown on the site plan is approved. PDQ shall work with the City Attorney to draft an easement that allows a City owned sign and structure to be placed in this location.
18. A preconstruction meeting shall be held prior to beginning construction.
19. The fence extension on the eastern side of site near the Crawford's Landing condominiums shall match the existing fence.
20. The plans shall be revised to show 8 gas pumps instead of 10 gas pumps and shall be submitted to staff for final approval.

The motion carried with five commissioners voting in favor (Holmquist, Dorschel, Fox, Thomas, and Stein) and one voting against (Ganser).

New Business

A. Consideration of Action on Request for Approval of Signage Permits for the Taco Bell at 100 E Broadway.

Aaron Engler, Border Foods of Wisconsin, LLC, stated that the new branded Taco Bell signage is included in the packet. Planner Reichertz said one wall sign is allowed per building, but there are exceptions if it fronts on more than one street. Taco Bell currently has 3 signs.

A motion was made by Mr. Homburg and seconded by Ms. Fox to approve the sign permit request, as proposed, according to Section 13-1-220 of the Monona Municipal Code of Ordinances.

Mr. Homburg stated that sometimes the Commission can be too cautious with building signs and that this time the applicant down-sized, already has three signs, and seems appropriate for the building and location.

The motion carried.

Reports of Staff and Commission Members

A. Staff Report Regarding Status of Development Project Proposals.

The 1/23/17 agenda will include Library and City Hall parking lot reconstruction. Discussion of the UCY projects will be scheduled in the future, most likely at the end of the spring semester.

B. Plan Commission Requests for Information Concerning Development Projects.

There were no requests for information.

Adjournment

A motion by Mr. Dorschel, seconded by Mr. Stein, to adjourn was carried. (9:18 pm)

Respectfully submitted by:
Sonja Reichertz, City Planner